

PAULA M. VARSANO

Looking for the Recluse and Not Finding Him In: The Rhetoric of Silence in Early Chinese Poetry

INTRODUCTION: WHEN WORDS AREN'T ENOUGH ...

Beneath the pines, I ask the boy; 松下問童子
He says his master's gone to gather herbs. 言師采藥去
Only in these mountains 只在此山中
The clouds are so deep, I know not where.¹ 雲深不知處

In this brief exchange between a poet and a youth, we hear an answer but not the question, and learn, simply, that someone is somewhere else. The poem, “Looking for the Recluse and Not Finding Him In” 尋隱者不遇, was written by the T'ang-era poet Chia Tao 賈島 (779-843), and is one of several of this period on the theme described by its title: the scholar-official's unsuccessful attempt to visit a recluse. In choosing to tell such a story, the poet describes an encounter with absence; he relays an anticipated conversation that never takes place. But, contrary to what one might expect in a story of a failed mission, the dominant tone of these poems is rarely disappointment. On the contrary, most T'ang-period “absent recluse” poems aspire to the portrayal of the strange, peaceful exhilaration of a poet's momentary brush with enlightenment.

The verbal depiction of this experience poses a challenge; for, whether we conceive of enlightenment in Taoist or Buddhist terms, its essence is thought to be coterminous with its inexpressibility. Whether in Lao-tzu's assertion of the unutterability of the Tao, or Ch'an Buddhism's suggestion that the Tao begins where sutras and teachings fall silent,² the mystical feeling of oneness has been repeatedly defined by the impossibility of its being conveyed in words. Yet, perhaps in response to the seriousness of that challenge, Chinese poets have, from the Six Dynasties period onward, tried their hand at (and, it is fair to say, attained some success in) doing just

¹ *Ch'uan T'ang shih* 全唐詩 (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1960; hereafter, *CIS*) 574, p. 6693.

² For a systematic study of the expression of Ch'an Buddhist philosophies of language in T'ang poetry, see Tu Sung-po 杜松柏, *Ch'an-hsüeh yü T'ang Sung shih-hsüeh* 禪學與唐宋詩學 (Taipei: Li-ming wen-hua shih-yeh kung-ssu, 1976).

that. But, how? What literary strategies did these poets employ in their attempt to communicate ineffable experience without naming (and thus betraying) it?

There is no dearth of traditional poems that speak, in one way or another, of the Tao; collections of Six Dynasties and T'ang poetry are replete with poems of Taoist and Buddhist inspiration, all apt subjects for examining the poetic strategies employed to this end. From the abstruse, darkly declarative *hsüan-yen* 玄言 poems of Kuo P'u 郭璞 (276–324) and Sun Ch'o 孫綽 (314–371), to the nature poetry of Wang Wei 王維 (701–761), to the poems on immortals by Li Po 李白 (701–762), all attempt to verbalize the personal encounter with the Tao and experiment with tools of expression inherited from the literary tradition as a whole. In this paper, I focus on the theme of the absent recluse, the poetic treatment of which seems to offer, for reasons that are discussed below, a particularly rich record of attempts to embody and – even more eloquently – disembody the poet's striving for, imagining, and perhaps even momentarily attaining an experience of oneness with the Tao.

As discussed by Yu-kung Kao, the earliest definitions of *shih* 詩 (probably dating from the Eastern Han, 25–220 AD) suggest that the *shih* evolved out of the need to express in words the things that words cannot “normally” express. The perception, as he sums it up, was that “ordinary language is an inadequate means of perpetuating and communicating this inner spirit, and only artistic language is capable of accomplishing this act of expression.”³ Poetry criticism dating from this same period further demonstrates a strong preference for language that conveys emotion without resorting to direct description. The seminal “Nineteen Old Poems” (of about the second century AD), for example, regarded within the tradition as the origin and essence of all that is best in five-character lyric poetry,⁴ are particularly cherished for successfully eschewing direct description of the poet's inner state.⁵

³ Yu-kung Kao, “The Aesthetics of Regulated Verse,” in Shuen-fu Lin and Stephen Owen, eds., *The Vitality of the Lyric Voice: Shih Poetry from the Late Han to the Tang* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 1986), p. 339.

⁴ Liu Hsieh accords the “Old Poems” the status of “the crown of five-character lyric poetry.” See Liu Hsieh 劉勰, “Ming shih” 明詩, in Chou Chen-fu 周振甫, ed., *Wen-hsin tiao-lung chu shih* 文心雕龍注釋 (Beijing: Jen-min wen-hsüeh ch'u-pan-she, 1983), p. 49.

⁵ See Kao, “Aesthetics of Regulated Verse,” pp. 341–45. For earlier expressions of this view, see Ma Mao-yuan 馬茂原, *Ku-shih shih-chiu-shou ch'u-t'an* 古詩十九首初探 (Xian, 1981); and Chu Tzu-ch'ing 朱自清, “Ku-shih shih-chiu-shou shih” 古詩十九首釋, in his *Ku shih-ko chien-shih san-chung* 古詩歌鑑釋三種 (Shanghai: Shang-hai ku-chi ch'u-pan-she, 1981). J. P. Diény offers an excellent summary of the traditional critical evaluation of the Nineteen Old Poems in the conclusion to his translation of the whole series; *Les dix-neuf poèmes anciens* (Paris: Université de Paris VII, Centre de publications Asie Orientale, 1974), pp. 161–87.

Kao is prominent among scholars who have contributed to furthering our understanding of how Chinese poetic language captures and conveys emotion. His analysis of the aesthetics of “regulated” (also known as “recent-style”) poetry,⁶ in particular, pinpoints the subtle control of poetic form as a site for the poet's expression of his inner state.⁷ And, in this specific category of poems, as well as in those elements of “old-style” poems that exhibit regulated characteristics, this line of reasoning has proven both accurate and productive. Indeed, insofar as succinctness may be taken as a way of inscribing silence within a poem, the eight-line regulated poem (and, *a fortiori*, the four-line regulated quatrain, or *chüeh-chu* 絕句) are fitting subjects for a study of the rhetoric of ineffability.

But there still remains a vast body of lyric poetry that was not subject to strict formal regulation: the entire corpus of poetic genres that sprung up during the period in question, from the poetic exposition (*fu* 賦) to the “folksong” (*yueh-fu* 樂府), and all the pre-T'ang *shih* in between. Because these forms do not systematically benefit from the brevity and spatialized structure of the regulated poems, it is necessary to look elsewhere to determine how nonregulated poems inscribe the experience of the ineffable.

One particularly promising angle from which to examine this question is to analyze intertextual strategies of meaning – broadly understood, the entire range of allusion, imitation, and repetition that require knowledge of other texts in order to understand the one at hand. Sometimes intertextuality can be seen as inhering through a series of poems belonging to a particular theme that eventually coalesces into a subgenre. As the subgenre matures through time and poets participating in it become more conscious of the role of their particular poem in the whole, the importance of intertextual practices as a strategy of meaning increases.

Poetry anthologies, from *Wen-hsüan* 文選 and *I-wen lei-chü* 藝文類聚 to *Wen-yüan ying-hua* 文苑英華, as well as certain collections of the works of individual poets, are organized roughly according to theme, and so reflect this mode of reading and writing. Of course, the list of designated themes is neither exhaustive nor rigid; it is not unusual to note a degree of overlap between categories, nor is it impossible to identify subgenres that,

⁶ “Recent-style,” or “regulated,” poetry is the genre of poetry that reached its apex during the T'ang (618–907), often referred to as the “Great Age” or “Golden Age” of Chinese poetry. These poems are characterized by their adherence to strict formal rules, including the prescribed use of parallelism and tonal alternation.

⁷ See esp. Kao Yu-kung and Mei Tsu-lin, “Meaning, Metaphor, and Allusion in T'ang Poetry,” *HJAS* 38.2 (1978), pp. 281–356; and Kao and Mei, “Syntax, Diction and Imagery in T'ang Poetry,” *HJAS* 31 (1971), pp. 49–136.

despite their demonstrable intertextual unity, have not been designated as such within these anthologies. One such “invisible” subgenre is that of the absent recluse. In *Wen-yüan ying-hua*, for example, poems treating this theme can be found scattered throughout the anthology, not only in the large group entitled “Recluses” (not all of whom are “absent”), but also in categories labeled Buddhists, Taoists, and Temples. In the following analysis of the complex intertextual strategies linking the absent-recluse poems, I hope not only to demonstrate the subgeneric unity of the poems in question, but, more importantly, to show that the particular types of intertextuality binding this group constitute the primary means of expression of the ineffable.

THE SILENT ELOQUENCE OF THE ABSENT RECLUSE

The archetypal figure of the recluse acquired its identity as the repository of wisdom and avatar of purity early in the Chinese literary tradition. In the *Ch'u-tz'u* poems the recluse makes sporadic appearances as either woodcutter or fisherman, emerging just long enough to share his secret for (and, perhaps, proclaim his success in) maintaining purity in the midst of an impure world. In the text of *Ch'un-ch'iu* he makes his appearance through the legendary personages of Po I and Shu Ch'i, whose stubborn withdrawal from a hostile world ended in their martyrdom. Most often nameless, unreachable (by design), and laconic, the recluse possesses a latent affinity with the quality of ineffability. The virtual inaccessibility of his home (either because it is impermanent or unreachable) and the unpredictability of his appearances seem to equate his essence with elusiveness, and render his silence as eloquent as his rare, elliptical utterances. By the time of the Six Dynasties, such latent associations linking reclusion with the ineffable become explicit, as literati – seeking to situate themselves on the service-reclusion continuum – try to clarify the increasingly murky parameters of true reclusion. One such writer was Shen Yüeh 沈約 (441–513) who, in putting forward the pivotal notion of “overt traces 跡,” brings the issue of language and reclusion to center stage.

As explained by Alan Berkowitz, Shen Yüeh's preface to “Accounts of Reclusion and Disengagement” 隱逸傳, puts forward the notion of “overt traces” – or, more precisely, their absence – as the defining criterion of true reclusion. According to Shen, the purity of the recluse is determined by the extent to which his “overt traces are not noticeably manifest, and [his] inner principle cannot be discerned.”⁸ The positing of the ideal re-

cluse's identity in the values of silence and invisibility was further refined by a rather more practical Juan Hsiao-hsü 阮孝緒 (479–536), who, in his classificatory work “Accounts of Lofty Reclusion” 高隱傳, asked whether (and, if so, when) circumstances should compel a recluse to subvert the “root” of the Tao and pass down his “overt traces.” According to Juan, corrupt times require a (presumably temporary) bending of the rules, for “... if [the Sages] did not pass down their overt traces, the world would lack the wherewithal for achieving peace.”⁹

Although the specific content of “overt traces” is not defined, the writings and editorial practices of Yüan Shu 袁淑 (408–453; compiler of “Accounts of Genuine Reclusion” 真隱傳), Shen, and Juan indicate that such traces did include linguistic artifacts, such as one's family name and writings; Yüan, for example, assiduously excluded from his compilation any recluse who let his name become known.¹⁰ The very act of composing and compiling these biographies and explicitly laying out the criteria for inclusion in such hallowed company dramatizes the tension between ideal moral purity and the linguistic expression apparently deemed necessary to the propagation of that purity. Poised between the deep-seated conviction that purity and language are incompatible, and the equally strong belief that a contingent world demands compromise, intellectuals of this period were hard-pressed to translate their ideals into transmittable form. The emergence of reclusion as a poetic theme coincided with these discussions and, not surprisingly, these poems present an eloquent fusion of the contradictory attitudes of acceptance and abhorrence of the compromise inherent in language itself.

The history of Chinese poetry is driven in part by the development of strategies to overcome the paradox of using words to convey the inexpressible. I would suggest that the absent recluse poem comes close to allegorizing this process, equating and conflating the poet's search for words to convey “meaning beyond the words” and the recluse's (more or less unwitting) transmission of his “overt traces” to convey the Tao.

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ABSENT-RECLUSE POEM

Poems treating the theme of the absent recluse can frequently be identified by their title, either an unmistakable “looking for the recluse and not finding him in” or a slightly modified or abbreviated version of that phrase.

Reclusion,” *JASOS* 111.4 (1991), p. 705.

⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 708.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 706.

⁸ As translated by Berkowitz in his “Hidden Spoor: Juan Hsiao-hsü and his Treatise on

The essence of the theme is embedded in the modal particle, “not 不” – the kernel of the five words “尋隱者不遇” and a succinct narration of the failed attempt to fulfill a desire. In many cases, the inconclusive expression “looking for” is sufficient to suggest the unsuccessful outcome of the poet’s quest; added to this, the simple negation provided by the more explicit “not” is all the more resonant for its apparent redundancy.

Not unlike recognized subgenres in the Chinese tradition, the theme of the “absent recluse” came to be subject to its own set of conventions and commanded its own repertoire of images, and syntactic and semantic cues. In order to examine the intertextual strategies that wove these conventions and cues into an expression of both the ineffable Tao and poetic ineffability, I want to isolate the essential components of this subgenre at what appears to be the height of its maturity during the T’ang, and then go back in time to trace their appearance during the Wei-Chin period. To this end, I have examined several T’ang poems that, because of the frequency of their anthologization and the renown of their authors, might be considered as representative works.¹¹ One such work is Ch’iu Wei’s 丘為 poem, “Looking for the Hermit of West Mountain and Not Finding Him In” 尋西山隱者不遇, which is remarkable not only for its beauty, but also for its graceful embodiment of practically all the constituent elements of the “absent-recluse” subgenre.

絕頂一茅茨	On the precipitous peak, a bracken hut,
直上三十里	A climb straight up of thirty <i>li</i> .
叩關無僮僕	I knock at the gate – no servant boy;
4 窺視唯案檯	I peek in the room – only a table and bench.
既非巾柴車	If he’s not abroad in his covered cart,
應是釣秋水	He must be fishing in the autumn waters.

¹¹ These include the following poems: Ch’iu Wei 丘為, “Looking for the Recluse of the Western Mountain and Not Finding Him In” 尋西山隱者不遇 (CTS 129), pp. 1317–18; Chia Tao, “Looking for the Recluse, But Not Finding Him In” (尋隱者不遇 (CTS 374), p. 6693; Li Po, “Looking for the Monk and Not Finding Him In” 尋山僧不遇作 (CTS 182), p. 1854; “Paying a Visit to the Taoist of Tai-tien Mountain and Not Finding Him In” 訪戴天山道士不遇 (CTS 82), p. 1858, and “Gazing Towards Chung-nan Mountain, I Send This to the Recluse of the Indigo Halls” 望終南山寄紫閣隱者 (CTS 172), p. 1767; Tu Fu, “Seeking the Recluse Fan the Tenth’s Dwelling, with Li Po” 與李十三白同尋范十隱居 (CTS 224), p. 2394; Li I 李益, “Paying a Visit to Red Pavilion Hall to Seek Kuang Hsüan, and Leaving This Behind upon Not Finding Him In” 詣紅樓院尋廣宣不遇留題 (CTS 283), p. 3227; Chiao-jan 皎然, “Looking for Lu Hung-chien and Not Finding Him In” 尋陸鴻漸不遇 (CTS 815), p. 9178; and, in what may well be an example of ineffability so extreme as to finally sound the bell of its demise, Wei Ying-wu’s 韋應物 “Sent to the Taoist of Ch’üan-chiao Mountain” 寄全椒山道士 (CTS 188), p. 1921.

差池不相見	This way and that, we do not meet;
8 滕冕空仰止	After all that effort, in vain I gaze in awe.
草色新雨中	The color of grass in new rain,
松聲晚窗裡	The sound of pines in an evening window.
及茲契幽絕	Arriving here at the summit of solitude,
12 自足盪心耳	Perfect contentment washes over my heart.
雖無賓主意	While there’s been no understanding of guest and host,
頗得清淨理	There is something of the sense of limpid purity.
興盡方下山	My desire abated, then did I descend the mountain,
16 何必見夫子	What need is there to see the master? ¹²

Bearing out the promise of the title, Ch’iu Wei’s story follows a clear and predictable line, and the sequence of events offers a virtually complete inventory of the poetics of the “absent recluse”:

- the awakening of the (frequently sudden) desire to make contact with the recluse;
- the trip up the mountain;
- the discovery that the recluse is not there;
- the observation of the traces of the recluse’s recent habitation;
- landscape description;
- the resolution of desire, usually through the recognition that it had been transformed.

While Ch’iu Wei’s poem purports to recount a real experience in the life of the poet, the narrative’s echo of the well-known theme of “turning back when the urge has abated 興盡而返” points to the possibility of a more broadly allegorical reading,¹³ a reading further supported by the conventionalized parallel between corporeal and spiritual journeys.¹⁴ In Ch’iu

¹² Cited above, n. 11.

¹³ According to *Shih-shuo hsin-yü*, the Chin-era scholar Wang Hui-chih 王徽之, unable to sleep one snowy night, took to singing Tso Ssu’s “Seeking the Recluse.” Then, overcome by an urgent desire to visit his friend Tai K’uei 戴逵, rowed a small boat through the blinding snowstorm to get there. Once he arrived, however, he discovered that the urge had passed. So he returned home, without so much as knocking on the door. See *Shih-shuo hsin-yü* 世說新語 (Shanghai: Shang-hai ku-chi, 1982), sect. “Jen tan” 任誕, vol. 2, pp. 396–97. The link between this story and that recounted by Ch’iu Wei is reinforced by the remark in the story that, right before setting off, Wang chanted Tso Ssu’s poem, “Seeking the Recluse,” whose position as forerunner of the “absent recluse” tradition is discussed below.

¹⁴ Besides Sun Ch’o’s poem “Wandering to the T’ien-t’ai Mountains” 遊天台山賦, perhaps the most significant poetic precedent for this parallel is in the well-known mountain-

Wei's poem, the poet travels and, as he moves, his relation to his natural surroundings evolves, metamorphosing from the antipathetic towards the sympathetic, from wilderness to paradise. At the same time, the poet's journey takes him along an inner path, through a transformation in three parts: he first acts upon his initial inspiration and embarks on the trip to meet the recluse (here, in lines 1-2, nature acts as a barrier between the poet and his goal); then he discovers that his desire cannot be fulfilled as planned (lines 3-8); and, last, he transposes his disappointment into the realization that his goal has been achieved in a profounder and spiritually more authentic way. Thus, nature-as-barrier dissolves and fuses with the Tao, becoming the mute expression of the enlightenment – the mystical feeling of unity – that the poet had been seeking at the outset (lines 9-16).

THE TROPE OF REPLACEMENT (I): REALIZING WHAT MIGHT HAVE BEEN

The immediate mechanism for this transformation of the unfulfilled goal into its opposite is what I term the trope of replacement, one form of which functions on the level of narrative. Like allegory, it points to the existence of an alternative narrative running parallel to the poem's explicit story line; but in contrast to allegory, the replacement trope evokes parallel, extra-narrative events through various mechanisms of negation or exclusion. In the case of the absent recluse poem, the narrative being negated and replaced is that of the successful visit to the recluse (an even more frequent theme in T'ang poems); the poet looks for the recluse, does not find him, but does find something else. The oblique reference to what might have been is so much a part of the realistic narrative as to seem insignificant; however, it is in the implied movement between narratives – between what "normally" would have been and what finally was – that the poem's meaning is inscribed.

On a straightforward semantic level, the replacement trope in Ch'iu Wei's poem is located in the title's negative particle, "Looking for the Recluse and *Not* Finding Him In." Then, in an elaboration of this simple ne-

gation, time and again, from different angles, the poet articulates what he sees and does only in terms of what those things are not. Ch'iu Wei's poem evokes the paradigmatic "negated narrative" as early as the second couplet, and documents the poet's successive disappointments: finding the unattended gate in place of the servant boy, and the empty room in place of the studious recluse. The poet's expectant peering and peeking is greeted by specific instances of absence, and leads inexorably to his "gazing in awe" – at no one and nothing in particular. It is here, in the precise middle of the poem (lines 7 and 8), that the threat of the failed meeting is realized: "This way and that, we do not *meet* 見 (literally, "to see") / After all that effort, in vain I gaze in awe." The missed opportunity is conveyed through verbs of vision – "to see" and "to gaze" – harmonizing simple, lived experience with immediately recognizable expressions of spiritual insight. As the miscarried meeting in the first half of the couplet is replaced by the objectless gaze of the second, absence replaces anticipated presence, and disappointment begins its transformation into enlightenment.¹⁵ With the removal of what he expected to see, perception itself becomes its own object, remarkable for its newfound sharpness and perfect receptivity: "The color of grass in new rain, / The sound of pines in an evening window. / Arriving here at the summit of solitude, / Perfect contentment washes over my heart."

This series of substitutions is such a natural, believable part of the quest-driven narrative that one might easily overlook its significance as a literary trope; the recluse wasn't there, so, of course the poet didn't see him, and "saw" something else. Yet, it is precisely in the implied transformation of what was supposed to have happened into what did happen that the ineffable is inscribed – both as signifier and signified, as device and as theme. The reader understands that the attainment of the Tao is no more the fruit of intentionality than true understanding can ever be the product of verbal explanation.

Furthermore, appearing within this particular thematic framework, the implicit narrative of transformation draws additional rhetorical power from a set of oppositions at once even more specific and more encompassing

climbing poems of Hsieh Ling-yün 謝靈運 (385-443). For Sun Ch'o's poem, see Hsiao T'ung 蕭統, ed., *Wen-hsüan* 文選 (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1981; hereafter, *WH*), vol. 1, ch. 11, pp. 163-66. For studies of the spiritual underpinnings of Hsieh Ling-yün's poetry, see: J. D. Frodsham, "The Origins of Chinese Nature Poetry," *AMNS* 8.1 (1960), pp. 68-104; Richard Mather, "The Landscape Buddhism of the Fifth Century Poet Hsieh Ling-yün," *JAS* 18 (1958-59), pp. 67-79; Francis A. Westbrook, "Landscape Transformation in the Poetry of Hsieh Ling-yün," *JAOS* 100.3 (1980), pp. 237-54.

¹⁵ The addition of the adverb *k'ung* 空 before the verb "to gaze" intensifies this reading. Conventionally but inadequately translated as "in vain" when used as a noun, it signifies "emptiness" or "the void." When used as an adverb, as in this instance, it signifies that the verb has no object – the action, no definable target or goal (thus its rather awkward rendering as "in vain"). The expression is extremely common in T'ang poetry, especially in poems that touch upon the theme of enlightenment, where it is used as much for its power to invoke Buddhist and Taoist notions of emptiness, as for its semantic contribution to the verse in which it appears.

than that of the presence or absence of the recluse. Undercutting the linear flow of the poem's narrative, but consistent with the binary aspect of Chinese philosophical discourse as a whole, is the poem's opposition of the poet-bureaucrat to the mountain-dwelling recluse – of the office-bound, socially obligated purveyor of words to the unfettered, unknown, and wordless hero. This opposition makes manifest the eternally unresolved Confucian / Taoist dilemma between two (apparently mutually exclusive) forms of self-cultivation: as practiced within the duty of service to the state and as expressed in the decision to withdraw from human society altogether. In interweaving the quest for enlightenment with this interdependent configuration of opposites, the trope of replacement almost seamlessly blends the syntagmatic structure of narrative with the paradigmatic structure of binary philosophical thought to recount the poet's momentary experience of the ineffable.

Turning again specifically to Ch'iu Wei's poem, the substitution of the hermit's absence for his anticipated presence joins the syntagmatic and paradigmatic levels of the poem, temporally situating the poet's encounter with the atemporal Tao. This substitution appears to operate on two levels: on the narrative level, where the poet might step into the void left by the absent recluse; and on the philosophical level, where silence slips into the vacuum left by the unuttered words.

First, and most obviously, the hermit's absence allows the poet to replace him – to stand, quite literally, in his place. Now he can experience, however briefly, the transformation from bureaucrat to sage. This literal "re-placement" works well for two reasons. First, inasmuch as the "where" of oneself is, in Chinese poetics, a primary means for establishing the subject, then, to inhabit the recluse's space is to assume his subjectivity – a reading rendered all the more plausible since the recluse's identity is a function of his place, away from society.¹⁶ Second, had they actually succeeded in meeting, the parallel narratives would have collapsed into one, poet and recluse would have happily coexisted in one moment, and the unspoken potential of the replacement trope would have been eliminated. This is not to say, of course, that the many poems depicting poet and recluse sitting side-by-side, sharing a jug of wine under the moonlight, carry no sense of spiritual transformation. But the difference between portraying

transformation-by-association and transformation-by-substitution is significant enough to have been pointed up by Ch'iu Wei in the following variation on this theme:

尋廬山崔徵君

日高雞犬靜
門掩向寒塘
夜竹深茅宇
秋庭冷石床
住山年已遠
服藥壽偏長
虛棄浮生者
相逢益自傷

On Going to Seek Recluse Ts'ui of Lu Mountain

The sun is high, the chickens and dogs grown silent;
The gate: closed against the chill pond.
Night bamboo engulfs thatched-roof eaves;
Autumn garden chills a stone bed.
Dwell in the mountains, the years recede,
Take elixirs, life ever lengthening.
Those who but pretend to abandon this floating life –
Meeting you, would suffer all the more.¹⁷

Ch'iu Wei, at least, is mindful of how an actual encounter between the hopeful and uncertain (if not totally insincere) poet-official and the seasoned recluse just might accentuate the prohibitive distance between the two. Perhaps, then, the recluse's removal is all the more propitious to opening the "Way" to the unmediated fusion of the poet with the Tao.

The recluse's absence further facilitates enlightenment by preventing the possibility, and thus obviating the necessity, of the originally planned verbal exchange. This lyrical incarnation of silence, as a trope both philosophical and aesthetic, confers the desired enlightenment upon the poem's author in both of his roles: as socially bound bureaucrat, on the one hand, and as poet, on the other. For the scholar-official, torn between a life of service and one of contemplative solitude in nature, the discovery of the recluse's superfluousness effectively equates silence with knowledge, absence with presence and, almost ironically, allows the poet, as we saw in the first poem, to depart from the mountain bearing the fruit of this non-encounter. There, in a wry echo of Wang Hui-chih 王徽之 (wry because Ch'iu's change of heart was externally motivated), Ch'iu Wei had concluded: "My desire abated, then did I descend the mountain, / What need is there to see the master?"

Indeed, in the absent-recluse poem the poet never takes up residence in the place of the recluse; sooner or later, he goes home, the moment of

¹⁶ For a detailed examination of the use of space and spatial metaphor in the construction of the self in traditional Chinese thought, as well as an exploration of the influence of this discourse on Chinese poetry, see Paula Varsano, "Getting There from Here: Locating the Subject in Early Chinese Poetics" in *HJAS* 56.2 (1996), pp. 375-403.

¹⁷ *CTS* 130, p. 1319.

awakening presumably indelibly etched in his memory. The hopeful intimation that the poet can return to his life in office and still maintain a state of spiritual awakening attenuates the importance of geographical location as a basis for opposing the recluse's identity with that of the scholar-official. Notwithstanding – or perhaps in direct reaction to – widespread skepticism concerning the moral and spiritual purity of those who call themselves “recluses in office,” Ch'iu seems to be subtly invoking Chuang-tzu's dictum that one need not permanently absent oneself physically from human society to be a true recluse. At first glance, it might seem that, given the strong geographical premise of the absent-recluse poem, it is almost perverse for Ch'iu to suggest that, just as the recluse did not have to be present to transmit his message to the poet, the poet need not settle in the mountains in order to benefit from its teachings. But poems such as this are about transformation and, considered in this light, Ch'iu's gradual, ever-so-subtle relativization of place emerges as a most apt means to complete the spiritual transformation of the poet-bureaucrat.

If Ch'iu Wei-as-government-official experiences enlightenment as a recasting of his role vis-à-vis society, Ch'iu Wei-as-poet apprehends enlightenment on the plane of language, where the communication of meaning through silence amounts to a philosophy of signification, echoing those claims of ancient Chinese thinkers concerning both the superfluousness and the inadequacy of language. Like the transformed relationship between bureaucrat and recluse, that between conversation and silence is conveyed through the trope of replacement. But in “Looking for the Hermit of West Mountain” it operates somewhat differently. By thematizing speech, this poem transforms language itself into both signified and signifier, and in a poem relating the ineffable experience of spiritual enlightenment, language must be made to imply its lack. In this absent-recluse poem, as in most of the others below, the figures of absence and silence are replaced by images of nature, which are construed by the newly enlightened poet as the wordless embodiment of the Tao. Thus, the couplet immediately after he gazed “in awe” is a pure description of nature: “The color of grass in new rain / The sound of pines in an evening window” (lines 9–10, “Looking for the Hermit of West Mountain”). While this poem is perhaps the best example of a complete inventory of all the elements of the absent-recluse poem, it is in its variants that we can most clearly apprehend the workings of the replacement trope, and the consistency with which it is used to convey the state of the ineffable.

The following poem by Wang Chi 王績 (585–644), whose own life fluctuated between service and reclusion, offers a narrative of replacement so extreme as to border on the uncanny.

策杖尋隱士

Walking Stick in Hand, I Seek the Recluse

策杖尋隱士
行行路漸賒
石梁橫澗斷

Walking stick in hand, I seek the recluse,
Walk on and on, the road grows long.

4 土室映山斜

At the stone bridge, the ravine is cut off;
An earthen hut catches the slanting mountain rays.

孝然疑有舍
威輦遂無家

In reverence, I take it as your dwelling;
Your lofty chariot – but then, no home.

置酒燒枯葉

Set out wine, and burn dead leaves;

8 披書坐落花

Open a book, sit on fallen flowers.

新垂滋水釣

Try again and dangle a line in the waters of the Wei;

舊結茂陵置

As in the old days, set hunting traps in Mao-ling.

歲歲長如此

Year in, year out – always like this;

12 方知輕世華

Only then comprehend the lightness of worldly treasures.¹⁸

Like Ch'iu Wei's poem, this one is built upon the substitution of what the poet seeks with what he eventually finds. From the first couplet, the reader is made aware of both the intentions that inspired the journey and the resolve driving its undertaking, firmly grasped in the walking stick and doggedly pursued in the telescoping length of road. In the second couplet, that seemingly endless path is abruptly broken by the sudden appearance of a stone bridge and earthen hut – overt traces that briefly promise, yet withhold, the fulfillment of the poet's aspiration. In the third couplet, that suspense is brought to its climax as the poet directly asserts his hope and fear in his supposition that he has found the recluse's abode, only to have his hopes summarily quashed in the undeniable discovery that there was nothing there.

Looking back at Ch'iu Wei's paradigmatic rendering of this quest in “West Mountain,” we note that, at the analogous point in that poem, the recluse's absence had been signaled by the poet's perception of a scene in nature, a perception more eloquently conveying the feeling of enlightenment than any words that the recluse could have uttered. The speaking subject had not changed; rather, the poet's replacement of the recluse was

¹⁸ *CIS* 37, p. 483.

inscribed in his newly won capacity to see the world through the recluse's eyes, while still permitting the poet's genius to convey that vision. In Wang Chi's poem, however, the replacement of recluse by poet verges on the fantastic. The traces left by the recluse have now been transformed from stimulus into backdrop, framing an absence into which the poet easily steps, shadowing the very gestures that (he imagines) the recluse had posed, presumably, in the very same place. The allusions to duke Chiang and Ssu-ma Hsiang-ju in lines 9 and 10 only serve to heighten the depth of field extending into the past, tingeing the atmosphere with a touch of nostalgic regret.¹⁹ It seems to matter little that the remembrance of these gestures is an act of imagination; with this reenactment, the linear time of the quest is cleaved and reassembled, as past and present unfurl simultaneously, and the narrative of what-might-have-been collides with what was.

Thus, in a fine resolution of the replacement process, the ambiguity of the speaker's identity established in line 7 permits the simultaneous reading of the two voices, recluse and poet, and a simultaneous envisioning of the two figures enacting gestures both ephemeral and eternal. From this position at the juncture where self and other unite, where then and now become indistinguishable, the concluding line – for all its apparent straightforwardness – resounds as a mystical pronouncement encompassing the absent recluse's immeasurable past and the poet's seemingly infinite future: “Year in, year out – always like this; / Only then comprehend the lightness of worldly treasures.”

As a final example of variations in the implementation of the replacement trope focusing attention on the interrelation between present and potential events, consider the following poem by Wang Wei.

春日與裴迪過新昌里訪臣逸人不遇	<i>When Passing Through the Hsin-ch'ang Quarter with Pei Ti on a Spring Day, We Stopped to Pay a Visit to the Recluse Ch'en But We Did Not Meet Him</i>
桃源一向絕風塵	The Peach Blossom Spring, ever cut off from worldly dust;
椰市南頭訪隱淪	At the southern edge of Yeh City, we paid a visit to one in retreat.
到門不敢題凡鳥	Arriving at his gate, we dare not inscribe him as a “common bird”;

¹⁹ In Ssu-ma Ch'ien's (ca. 145 – ca. 85 BC) “Genealogical History of Duke Ch'i,” Lü Shang 呂尚 (also known as Lü Wang 呂望), an elderly and poor man, was fishing in the waters of

4 看竹何須問主人	Look at the bamboo – what need is there to ask the host?
城外青山如屋裡	Beyond the city walls, green mountains: like being sheltered in his room;
東家流水入西鄰	Flowing waters of homes in the east enter the neighboring west.
閉戶看書多歲月	Close the door, read your books – how many years and months?
8 種松皆老作龍鱗	Planted pines grown old enough to be the scales of dragons. ²⁰

One of the most striking features of this poem is the vivid contrast between the extremely detailed occasional information provided in the title and the nearly exclusively conventional content of the poem. Peppered throughout with conventional emblems of the recluse, especially those associated with T'ao Yüan-ming, the body of this poem seems to signify nothing so much as its own affiliation with other poems on recluses. Besides the unsurprising mention of the Peach Blossom Spring, other more subtle reminders of T'ao Yüan-ming appear in his mention of the superfluity of the host (line 4), and, much more schematically, in the image of the concentric construction of T'ao's secluded world of the garden (line 5). In like manner, Wang Wei also includes references to Juan Chi's “common birds” (line 3) as a point of contrast with the loftiness of the recluse, the bamboo (line 4), the books (line 7), and the pines (line 8). Yet, precisely because this poem seems to be quilted together with scraps of language that could have been stored in a box labeled “reclusion,” variations in the narrative merit even closer scrutiny.

The first half of the poem conforms nicely to the sequence of introductory elements we have come to expect in absent-recluse poetry. Wang Wei evokes the purity and relative remoteness of the recluse's dwelling, the intent to visit him, the arrival at his destination. But, unlike the narrative

the Tzu tributary of the Wei River, hoping to waylay Prince Wen of Chou. The prince met him while hunting and, taking him for a sage, brought him to the court and named him “venerable tutor” 師尚父; see *Shih-chi* 史記 (Beijing: Chung-hua, 1980) 32, pp. 1477–78. Mao-ling is a reference to the place where Ssu-ma Hsiang-ju 司馬相如 (179–117 BC), retired because of failing health, and ultimately died; “set hunting traps” is a reference to his well-known *fu* on the imperial hunt, as well as his subsequent tenure at court, during which he frequently accompanied emperor Wu on hunting parties. Taken together, these two allusions suggest an attitude of resignation to life in retirement, tinged with a sense of talents not being fully utilized.

²⁰ Li Fang 李昉 et al., comps., *Wen-yüan ying-hua* 文苑英華 (Beijing: Hsin-hua, 1966) 232, p. 7b.

recounted in the other poems we have discussed thus far, failure to fulfill his original intent is not because the recluse couldn't be found, but because the poet changes his mind at the last minute, and decides not to intrude on Ch'en's solitude. This powerful variation may be read as a reassertion of the heretofore hidden precedent provided by Wang Hui-chih's famous decision to turn back without seeing his friend, not because his friend wasn't there, but because "when the urge has abated" one must not persist in its fulfillment. Wang Wei's evocation of this story stands in contrast to that of both Ch'iu Wei and Wang Chi, for here he resituates the locus of desire, not in the external conditions of the mundane world, but back within one's own consciousness. With this transformation, Wang Wei does not contradict, but more strongly asserts, what was already latent in the absent recluse theme.

It is precisely this realization that sets the terms for what happens next: a series of imaginings that effectively collapse the distinction between inside and outside (line 5), bring the extremes of east and west into close proximity (line 6), and expand man's life span to encompass the temporal dimension of the immortal dragon (line 8). The whole story is one of replacement, then, wherein Wang's encounter with the recluse's traces erases the boundary, not only between near and far, but between self and other; Wang can now see the physical world through the recluse's eyes, and has, almost literally, replaced him. In the face of this profound transformation, it is easy to forget the title's insistence on the specific occasion and momentary nature of this event. Difficult as it is to interpret, it should not be ignored; it seems unsatisfactory to simply conclude that Wang is merely conforming to convention, although convention clearly plays an important role. What seems more likely is that in this insistent alignment with a particular set of conventions the present poem's dialogue is inscribed within the paradigm set by more straightforward poems such as that by Ch'iu Wei.

THE TROPE OF REPLACEMENT (2):

UNSAING THE ALREADY SAID

Thus far in our discussion, we have focused on the replacement trope as it operates on the narrative level, where, simply put, the poet stands in the recluse's place and assumes his view of the world. This nearly simultaneous inscription and erasure of the nameless recluse's "overt traces" is an effective means of controverting the linguistic paradox, but it is not the only means at a poet's disposal when working with this theme. Only when

language itself is reduced to that place where it can approach silence (without being overcome by it) can the one embody the potentiality of the other, and the mystical experience of the Tao be both achieved and expressed. It is in striving towards this goal that the usefulness of thematic affiliation as an expressive (and, thus, analytical) tool becomes clear. By extending the replacement trope beyond the bounds of a particular poem to encompass a group of thematically affiliated poems, the poet can posit silence precisely at the site of one poem's link to those that preceded it.

Specifically, silence can be made to overtake speech through the act of omission, through a linguistic paring down of the narrative that has already been established in earlier poems. The poem by Chia Tao, placed as an epigram to this article, was written at least a generation later than that of Ch'iu Wei and discloses the search for the ineffable precisely in this way.

Even without knowledge of the absent-recluse theme, this well-known work stands as a model of the simplicity and restraint most valued in the T'ang quatrain. Now, with Ch'iu Wei's poem fresh in our minds, we are all the more sensitive to Chia Tao's silent adoption of silence itself. Like Ch'iu Wei, Chia Tao is a witness to absence, but whereas the older poem unfurls the narrative from the consistent and sequential viewpoint of the scholar-official, Chia Tao's poem does away with the narrative, the only words presented being words that were exchanged – real utterances that replace those that were originally anticipated, uttered by a nameless boy replacing a nameless recluse. This covering over of linguistic traces is not unlike the clouds covering over the recluse's overt, bodily traces; but we know what they cover because we've seen it all before. No reference is made, nor need be made, to the awakened and subsequently thwarted motivating desire, to the confrontation with a forbidding and then paradisiacal landscape, nor to the explicit resolution of the poet's desire. It suddenly seems clear that such references would be, at best, superfluous, and at worst, antithetical to the poem's world view as a whole. Through this strategy of reduction, the language of silence has crossed over from the edges of the poem into the poem itself. In this example, the signifying power of intertextuality shows itself in full; Chia Tao's poem can successfully enact ineffability because the poems that led to it grazed the edges of articulated meaning. It is because Ch'iu Wei directly asserted the preference for silence over communication ("What need is there to see the master?") that we know that Chia Tao's "not knowing" (*pu-chih*) has replaced, and thus become, "knowing" at its most profound.

To summarize: in Ch'iu Wei's poem, the replacement of the poet-official for the recluse led to the experience of the ineffable and, by extension, enlightenment. In comparison, however, Chia Tao's poem comes even closer to ineffability – also through an act of replacement. Through the intertextual strategy of thematic association, the later poet was able both to articulate the ineffable and embody ineffability by substituting silence where there had previously been language.

RETRACING THE PATH OF INEFFABILITY

The choice of the trope of replacement as a means to achieve the ineffable has far-reaching implications. As a mode of signification, it is perhaps the strongest illustration of the arbitrariness of words in general, and of poetic lyrics in particular. Consistent with the earlier rhetorical flourishes of Lao-tzu and Chuang-tzu, it leads to silence by luring the reader deeper and deeper into the netherworld, where meaning flees the precinct of words themselves, and words can be configured as equivalent to their opposites. On a more pragmatic level, the trope of replacement can express a reliance on previous utterances, such that the greatest approximation of ineffability is achieved through the act of pointing silently at something that has already been said by someone else.

Some of the important antecedents of the absent-recluse poem are found, not in earlier poems, but in the adjacent realm of literary lore. In prefaces, biographies, and anecdotes, figures appear whose paternity is unmistakable. A particularly well-known example is an anecdote concerning Sun Teng 孫登, the recluse renowned for his uncanny ability to whistle. It appears in the biography of the poet Juan Chi 阮籍 (210–263) as recorded in the *History of the Chin*. The story is significant, not only because it depicts Sun's preference for whistling over conversation as an ideal means of expression, but also because it contains that narrative kernel found later in the "absent recluse" subgenre – the unfulfilled desire to enter into conversation with a sage-recluse dwelling in the mountains, thereby obtaining wisdom.

Once [Juan] Chi met Sun Teng on Su-men Mountain. [Juan Chi] touched on topics of ancient times, and on the arts of "posing the spirit" and "leading the breath." [Sun] Teng kept silent throughout. As a result, [Juan] Chi expelled a long whistle, and took his leave. When he had descended halfway down the mountain, he heard a sound like the cry of the phoenix resounding throughout the peaks and valleys. It was the whistling of [Sun]

Teng. 籍嘗於蘇門山遇孫登. 與商略終古及棲神導氣之術. 登皆不應. 籍因長嘯而退. 至半嶺, 聞有聲若鸞鳳之音, 響乎岩古, 乃登之嘯也.²¹

It doesn't take more than a cursory reading of this passage to recognize that the link between this text and the absent-recluse poems extends deeper than the obvious similarities in the surface narrative. Here we find another text whose rhetorical power derives from its negation of an implied parallel narrative: in this case, the dialogue between a disciple and his master, that most time-honored method of conveying moral or spiritual knowledge. In the earliest incarnations of this type of verbal exchange as found in *Chuang-tzu*, the Confucian *Analects*, and *Mencius*, to name obvious examples, the questioner receives a reply. In such examples, even if the sage's epigrammatic style signals his well-known mistrust of words, the dialogue form imposes the paradoxical necessity of a verbal response – some attempt to communicate the incommunicable.²² The Sun Teng episode takes a significant step towards circumventing this paradox. Rather than speak in a language destined to hide as much as it communicates, Sun Teng offers his visitor a more direct representation of the ineffable Tao – his superhuman whistle, a primordial sound that does not describe the secrets of the universe, but incarnates it. The gap between sign and the unsignifiable is narrowed as meaning is successfully conveyed via the withholding of words. In Sun Teng's nonverbal cosmic whistle – both an echo of Chuang-tzu's "heavenly flutes" and a nod to the primacy of music over language – this narrative begins to find its way out of the impasse of verbalizing the ineffable.²³

But while the words have been removed, the presence of the recluse

²¹ "Biography of Juan Chi"; *ch.* 49 of *Chin shu* (SPPY edn.; Taipei: T'ai-wan chung-hua shu-chü, 1981).

²² One typical exchange is found in *Mencius*: "Kao Tzu said, 'What is inborn is called nature.' Mencius said, 'When you say that what is inborn is called nature, is that the same as saying that white is white?' 'Yes.' 'Then is the whiteness of the white feather the same as the whiteness of snow?...' *Meng-tzu cheng-i* 孟子正義 6A/3 (Chu-tzu chi ch'eng edn.; Beijing: Chung-hua, 1993), vol. 1, *ch.* 11, pp. 434–35; trans. Wing-tsit Chan, *A Source Book in Chinese Philosophy* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 1963), p. 52.

²³ See Wang Hsien-ch'ien 王先謙, ed., *Chuang-tzu chi-chieh* 莊子集解 (Chu-tzu chi-ch'eng edn.) vol. 3, *ch.* 1, pp. 6–7, sect. "Discourse on Making Things Equal" ("Ch'i-wu lun" 齊物論), which recounts a conversation between two men, Tzu-ch'i and Tzu-yu, in which the "flutes of heaven" are the inspiration of a rhapsodic passage, partially quoted here:

Tzu-ch'i said, "When the greatest of clods, which is the Earth, exhales its breath, the name that we give it is 'wind.' But this is only when it is not in action. Once it acts, all the thousands of fissures bellow forth in their fury – haven't you heard them howling? In forests on rugged crags there are great trees whose trunks are a hundred armspans around; and they have holes and fissures like snouts and like mouths and like ears and like basins and like sockets and like mortars and like sinkholes and like oozes. There are splashing and whizzings and rantings and slurpings and screechings and wailings and dronings and

has not. Quite to the contrary, he is there waiting, and even has a name. By T'ang times the hermit himself ends up going the way of Sun Teng's words, not only definitively losing his name and face, but his corporeality as well. When that happens, the sign of ineffability will be transposed from Sun's whistle to the lofty and untamed natural surroundings he inhabited. This process, the gradual transposition of meaning from the exchange of elliptical words to no words at all, is evident in the absent-recluse poetry of the Six Dynasties.

Another literary text with archetypal significance for the absent-recluse subgenre is T'ao Yüan-ming's "Preface to 'The Peach Blossom Spring'" – a short narrative that recounts two journeys to a utopian land. In the first voyage (which occupies the bulk of the narrative), a man comes upon this place out of time, quite by accident. He was merely following the banks of a stream. The second voyage is undertaken by a man who heard about the place (because the first man broke his promise to the villagers not to talk about it) and, attempting to follow the directions given by the first man, never arrives. Instead, he is overtaken by some unidentified illness and dies. The meaning is clear enough: true enlightenment is the enemy of the word – be it descriptive (in the first visitor's attempt to describe that place to others) or prescriptive (as in subsequent would-be travelers' attempts to give or follow directions). In any case, enlightenment cannot be attained by intentional searching any more than it can be encompassed in descriptive language. It is true that the setting forth of goals, like the setting forth of language, does exist in the absent recluse poem (as it does in spiritual pursuits); but this poetics recognizes that, like the mountain upon which the absent recluse habitually dwells, obstacles built of goals and words are really just byways in disguise.

Besides those narrative sources as found in prefaces and biographies, there are also some very striking poetic antecedents of the absent-recluse

keenings. ..." (trans. Stephen Owen, *An Anthology of Chinese Literature: Beginnings to 1911* [New York and London: W. W. Norton and Company, 1996], p. 114).

In the "Record of Music," a section of the *Book of Rites (Li-chi)* – a collection of Confucian writings that probably date from during the Warring States and Han dynasties – the production of music is described as man's most immediate response to the things and events he encounters: "All tones that arise are generated from the human mind. When the human mind is moved, some external thing has caused it. Stirred by external things into movement, it takes on form in sound. When these sounds respond to one another, mutations (i.e., changes from one sound to another) arise; and when these mutations constitute a pattern, they are called 'tones.' When such tones are set side by side and played on musical instruments, ... it is called 'music.'" Translation from Owen, *Readings*, p. 51. This view of music as an immediate response to the world is echoed in the "Great Preface" as well.

poem. And it is these early poems that were most influential in shaping the rhetoric of the ineffable. One among the several groups of poems that suggest themselves as a possible source bears the title "Chao yin" 招隱. "Chao" can mean either to summon or to seek; "yin," the object of that verb, means "the hidden one" or "recluse." Taken as a simple phrase in isolation, then, this expression is ambiguous, meaning either "Summoning the Recluse" [to come to the speaker] or [going off and] "Seeking the Recluse." This ambiguity, while clearly inherent in the word "chao," remained latent in the earliest, Han-dynasty, poems of this category. In those first works to bear that title, it was still content – rather than convention – that ensured clarity.

The earliest "Chao yin," attributed to a courtier of the Han prince of Huai-nan, is an unambiguous plea to a recluse to return to the service of his prince, and so the title should be read as "Summoning the Recluse." It is itself a direct descendant of the ceremonial song in *Ch'u tz'u* titled "Chao hun" 招魂 ("Summoning the Soul"), which calls a dead person's soul to reenter the body. Likewise, "Chao yin" tries to persuade the wayward minister taking refuge in the mountains to return to the court. Both the earlier "Chao hun" and this first "Chao yin" evoke the terrors of the wilderness (as opposed to the comfort of the familiar) to persuade the hearer to return. To quote an excerpt:

Jagged and craggy, clefts of the hills,
there the heart lingered, dazed with dread,
its murky recesses sent shivers of fright,
caves of leopards and tigers,
in deep forest thickets a man climbs from fear.
[...]
He snaps cassia branches and lingers a while,
leopards and tigers battle, bears bellow,
then beasts and birds shudder, they do forget kin.
Come home now my prince –
in the hills one may not linger so long.²⁴

However, starting soon after Han times, poems bearing the same name, but with radically different content, exposed the heretofore latent ambiguity. While the original Han "Chao yin" poem argues against seclusion, the best-known post-Han poems of the same name reverse this completely. Two authors of "Chao yin" poems of this period are Tso Ssu 左思 (ca. 253

²⁴ Chu Hsi 朱熹, ed., *Ch'u-tz'u chi-chu* 楚辭集注 (Shanghai: Shang-hai ku-chi ch'u-pan-she, 1979), pp. 167–69; trans. Owen, *Anthology*, pp. 211–12.

– ca. 307) and Lu Chi 陸機 (261–303) and, in their poems, instead of “summoning” the recluse, they are “seeking” him – not to bring him back, but to consort with him, to taste, if only for a moment, his solitary life.²⁵

This sudden inversion of the title’s meaning resonates strongly with the use of parallel narratives and replacement in the poetry of the absent recluse. By bringing the latent ambiguity of the title that much closer to the surface, these poets effectively foreshadow the bipolarity that would later become the basis of this subgenre’s rhetoric of the ineffable. Even if, as I believe to be the case, this ambiguity was not discussed in the traditional commentaries appended to these poems, the title itself could compel readers to decide between two opposing philosophies, confronting them with a first-hand experience of the malleability and unreliability of language.

Here is the first of the two “Chao yin” poems written by Tso Ssu:

杖策招隱士	My walking stick in hand, I go and seek the recluse;
荒途橫古今	Desolate wilderness stretches from antiquity to this very day.
岩穴無結構	Mountain grottos there are, but no constructed hut,
4 丘中有鳴琴	While through hills and valleys is the singing of a lute.
白雪停陰岡	White snow stops at the northern slope,
丹葩曜陽林	Cinnabar flowers illumine the southerly woods.
石泉漱瓊瑤	A stony spring rinses bits of jade,
8 纖鱗亦浮沉	Minnows now and then emerge, and disappear.
非必絲與竹	Here, what need of string and pipes? –
山水有清音	The mountain water has its own crystal tune.
何事待嘯歌	Why wait for voices singing,
12 灌木自悲吟	When stands of trees sing their own sad song?
秋菊兼糗糧	Autumn chrysanthemums can be collected for food,
幽蘭間重襟	And sweet-dark orchids gathered o’er my robes.
躊躇足力煩	I pause, my legs weak –
16 聊欲投吾簪	For a moment, I almost cast away my official’s hair-pin. ²⁶

²⁵ *Wen-hsüan* also includes a poem entitled “Fan chao-yin” 反招隱 by the Chin-era poet Wang K’ang-chü 王康瑀. There seems to be no biography available of Wang’s life, but his poem, the only complete extant example of his work, stands as an eloquent and occasionally cited early poetic expression of the view that the great recluse is precisely he who manages to maintain his spiritual purity while living in the midst of human society. As this poem is in direct response to the poems by Tso and Lu, there is little question of ambiguity, either in the title or in the poem itself; *WH*, vol. 2, ch. 22, pp. 310b–11a.

²⁶ *WH*, vol. 2, ch. 22, pp. 309a–10b.

Practically an inversion of earlier poems bearing the same title, Tso Ssu’s “Chao yin” embodies the most radical of all substitutions: the complete replacement of one poem by another. Insofar as a title creates expectations about content, readers first encountering this poem almost certainly had to go back and revise their understanding of the title. It is here that the replacement trope begins to make itself felt; reconsideration of the old title, far from erasing the earlier text, obliges the reader to engage it in a very direct way. Thus, even at this early stage in the subgenre’s development, the manifest existence of two parallel narratives allows the poem simultaneously to narrate and embody an aesthetic and spiritual transformation, just as the T’ang poems would later do. On the narrative level, the poet himself undergoes change (even though, at the end, it does become apparent that Tso Ssu does not complete the transformation). On the intertextual level, the poem itself is transformed. At both levels, the ineffability of enlightenment is contained between discrete moments of change.

On the first, narrative level, the poet, a scholar-official going off to seek a recluse, begins his own transformation into a recluse. In keeping with the Buddhist and Taoist aesthetics of the times, the ostensible agent of this transformation is nature.²⁷ Upon arriving at the recluse’s dwelling, the poet perceives only the recluse’s natural surroundings and, almost at once, nature’s power to transform becomes manifest. In a perfectly straightforward use of parallelism, lines 3 and 4 depict the poet’s initial surprise: “Mountain grottos there are, but no constructed hut, / While through hills and valleys is the singing of a lute.”

The parallel positioning of “no constructed hut” and “[there] is the singing of a lute” draws attention to the contrast between what the poet expected when he first set out and what he ended up finding there. Prefiguring the T’ang title “Looking for the Hermit and Not Finding Him In,” the modal particles in these lines convey the essential link between the nonfulfillment of expectations (embodied in the empty, utterable house) and unanticipated discovery (carried, not by words, but by music). And, in case there could be any residual doubt concerning the significance of the indissoluble connection between “missing” and “finding,” Tso Ssu has built this couplet upon the words *wu* 無 and *yu* 有 (“non-being” and “being,” “non-action” and “action” – among the most philosophically charged pairs in

²⁷ In addition to the essays by Frodsham and Westbrook mentioned above, n. 14, for a discussion of the evolution of nature poetry in relation to the spiritual concerns of the times, see Lothar Ledderose, “The Earthly Paradise: Religious Elements in Chinese Landscape Art,” in Susan Bush and Christian Murck, eds., *Theories of the Arts in China* (Princeton: Princeton U.P., 1983), pp. 165–83.

the language, as noted earlier). Whereas in such T'ang poems as those by Ch'iu Wei and Chia Tao absence replaces presence, and the ensuing silence is sufficient to convey the ineffability of the poet's new awareness, here, four hundred years earlier, the absence of the hermit and his words must still be replaced by some type of presence: in this case, the presence of music.

And why music? The notion of music's priority over language (expressed in the anecdote about Sun Teng) and its status as an incarnation rather than an expression of the Tao are present in the very earliest texts that theorized about the nature of poetry.²⁸ Music's insertion at this point in the text, then, may well constitute an intermediate step towards the primordial silence of the Tao and, by implication, a step towards that moment prior to poetry itself. It is here, where music replaces the absent words of the recluse, that Tso Ssu plants the seed of his own transformation and enlightenment.

His ears now attuned to the "flutes of heaven," the poet displays in two purely descriptive parallel couplets (lines 5-8) his suddenly awakened sensitivity to the details of the scene before his eyes. Only then, as an "awakened" Tso Ssu delves more deeply into his surprise at not finding what he expected, does he fulfill the earlier promise implicit in the foregrounding of *wu* and *you*: "Here, what need of string and pipes? - / The mountain water has its own crystal tune. / Why wait for voices singing, / When stands of trees sing their own sad song?"

Now, newly mindful of nature's beauty, Tso can move forward (which, in this context, is more accurately understood as backward in time) from that intermediate step of music, and arrive at its absence, if not yet at absolute silence. In rhetorical questions that alternately pit the language of man's music against that of nature, Tso Ssu unerringly favors the latter. Nature's status as a barrier between himself and the object of his quest is being transformed, and, in the process, so is he, as he learns to replace what he has had (and desired) with what he has found. Admittedly, the poet's language is still going about the business of naming concrete objects that one finds in nature, but the desire to reject that language is manifest.

Finally, in the penultimate couplet, Tso Ssu effectively extends the trope of replacement to include his own person. In a gesture reminiscent of

Ch'ü Yüan, he acknowledges the possibility of consuming and adorning himself with nature's flora in lieu of grain and cloth, thereby doing away with one last physical barrier. All that is left now is for him to acquiesce to the process of transformation that has just taken place; but, in the final line, he stops short: "I pause, my legs weak - / For a moment, I almost cast away my official's hairpin." At this point in the tradition, the scholar-official finds himself at the threshold of enlightenment but does not enter.

This final hesitation, as frustrating as it may seem to the reader who has been looking forward to the poet's ultimate attainment of enlightenment, is not, after all, a negation of the poem's meaning, but is quite coherent with both the poem's language and its position within the "Chao yin" tradition. As we have already noted, the poet, for all his skill in focusing attention upon the unspoken, had not quite attained the ineffable, having resorted instead to the use of explicit rhetorical questions and outright comparison. Rereading the poem in light of this suspension of the movement toward enlightenment, one cannot help but reinterpret the allusion to Ch'ü Yüan as well. That ancient poet who, a moment ago, seemed the very figure of Chuang-tzu's free wanderer is now revealed to have been wandering against his will, and his poem now a long lament expressing the overwhelming desire to return and continue serving his prince. The resurgence of this "other" reading suggests that it is really quite easy for even parallel narratives to cross tracks suddenly. It is also, and perhaps more significantly, a resounding reminder of the title's all-but-forgotten ambiguity.

Even now, the process of rereading (or, more accurately, un-reading) is not yet complete. We have mentioned that the poet's transformation was triggered by his encounter with nature. In its transformative role - the one suggested by our first "substitutive" reading - nature allows the poet immediate access to the Tao, partly by the power of its own beauty, and partly by its capacity to hide the hermit, reinforcing his eponymous quality of "hiddenness." Just as the hermit is concealed somewhere among the grottos and valleys, the last four lines of the poem promise that the poet, too, will partake of and dress himself with its substance and so become indistinguishable from the surrounding scene. Had this process been completed, nature would have been transformed from an intractable barrier to a spiritual and physical extension of the poet: from the ominous wilderness of the Han "Chao yin" poems, to paradise. But with ambivalence comes ambiguity, and it becomes apparent that, in the end, nature is responsible, not for facilitating the poet's access to the Tao, but for the suspension of his enlightenment. The allusion to Ch'ü Yüan has recast the metonymical prom-

²⁸ For a discussion of the earliest uses of music and musical instruments as fundamental metaphors for human manifestation of the Tao, see Kenneth DeWoskin, *A Song for One or Two: Music and the Concept of Art in Early China*, Michigan Papers in Chinese Studies 42 (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, 1982).

ise of nature (and its associations of unity with the Tao) into metaphorical representations of Confucian morality; and so the process of union with nature – at least the Taoist conception of it – is halted.

Now, if the transformation on the narrative level is anticipated but not completed, the same is true for the transformation on the second, intertextual level. In purely generic terms, the poem seems to confront the “Chao yin” poem of Huai-nan Hsiao-shan – a confrontation that only reinforces the original promise of transformation. As the poet sets out on his journey to “summon the hermit,” the reader is primed by the title (still seemingly unambiguous) to believe that the poet intends to summon the hermit back to his own, official world. As we have just seen, however, the opposite nearly takes place as Tso comes perilously close to joining (or, more precisely, replacing) the hermit in his hidden paradise. But in the end, it seems that the Ch’u and Han versions of “Summoning the Hermit” reassert themselves, preventing completion of the substitutive allusion.

Given the reversals that result from two consecutive readings of the same poem, and the resurgent awareness of the title’s ambiguity, it seems difficult to follow the transformations to a definitive end and arrive at a final interpretation. But the “falling short” of the transformations is what these poems are about. Having laid the foundation for a movement toward enlightenment and the ineffable, the poem enacts the recluse’s philosophy only insofar as enlightenment was actually attained, that is, to a relative degree, openly measured against the poet’s original aspirations. The partiality of the achievement, however, does not diminish the significance of the silent dialogue between this poem and its antecedents, or that between the poet and the recluse he never meets. Just as the poem’s very existence resonates with (and depends upon) its predecessors, so the poet-official’s identity is determined by his “alter-ego.”

Lu Chi’s poem by the same title also contributed to the development of the T’ang absent-recluse theme, repeating many of the familiar tropes of Tso Ssu’s poem, but further refining the poetic expression of ineffability.

明發心不夷	Dawn breaks, my heart still does not rest;
振衣聊躑躅	I shake out my clothes, then pace to and fro.
躑躅欲安之	I pace to and fro, but where should I go?
4 幽人在浚谷	The hidden one is in the deep valley.
朝采南澗藻	At dawn he gathers reeds in the southern ravine,
夕息西山足	At night he rests at the foot of West Mountain.
輕條象雲構	Slender branches like a lofty pavilion;

8 密葉成翠幄	Dense foliage, an iridescent canopy.
激楚停蘭林	A “Chi-ch’u” air stirs the fragrant woods;
回芳薄秀木	“Hui-fang” ²⁹ fills the graceful trees.
山溜何泠泠	Clinking crystal is the mountain stream;
12 飛泉漱鳴玉	Spouting springs rinse singing jade.
哀音附靈波	The mournful tune glides on divine ripples,
頽響赴曾曲	And the fading echo lingers in nooks and bends.
至樂非有假	The attainment of ultimate joy depends not on things without;
16 安事澆醇樸	To what end degrade one’s pure nature?
富貴苟難圖	If indeed wealth and prosperity are hard to plan –
稅駕從所欲	Let me take myself off, and follow my heart’s desire. ³⁰

This poem, like the one by Tso Ssu, enters into a dialogue with its Han predecessor. However, Lu’s piece differs in a fundamental and significant way: it does not explicitly raise the question of the hermit’s absence or presence – of the missed or consummated encounter. Instead, the action is imminent, and remains so throughout. The mode is still that of substitutive allusion, and Lu Chi comes much closer to following that process of substitution through to the end.

The sense of imminence is inscribed in a series of small surprises. Lu Chi begins with the evocation of insomnia, common in the poems of the Wei and Chin period, and a particularly apt way of introducing his motivation, or *hsing* 興. Then, in a passage strongly reminiscent of archetypal visits to sages, Lu Chi’s narrator prepares to move. However, his “move” consists of nothing more than inconclusive, undirected pacing; his body, in an eloquent expression of the poet’s entrapment, goes nowhere, and the expected visit does not take place. This time, it is not because the recluse is absent, but because the poet is. We sense that this poet-official has learned the lesson of “geographical relativity” and its attendant quality of ineffability. Replacement plays an important role, of course, this time linked with the earlier literary tradition of the “spirit voyage”; somewhere in the transition between lines 3 and 4, the poet leaves his body behind while only his spirit – embodied in his vision – embarks on the quest. As is typical in “traveling immortal 遊仙” (*yu-hsien*) poetry, and reminiscent of the *Chuang-tzu* episodes of “spiritual voyage 神遊” (*shen-yu*), the poet, now unencum-

²⁹ “Chi-ch’u” and “Hui-fang” are names of ancient dance tunes.

³⁰ *WH*, vol. 2, ch. 22, p. 310.

bered by corporeal limitations, overcomes the anticipated obstacle of the mountain, and soon finds himself able to see clearly, there in the valley, the very man whose invisibility is the essence of his identity: "the hidden one." Then, beginning with line 7, the poet "sees" and describes – in a manner indistinguishable from presumably "real" landscape description – the recluse's dwelling. This encounter without meeting suffices to persuade the poet to join (or at least plan to join) the hermit in his freedom.

The trope of replacement is instrumental in depicting this process. In the very first lines of the poem, spiritual travel replaces the physical. Clearly, "the hidden one" is not visible to mortal, fleshly eyes; yet, for the briefest of moments, in lines 4 through 6, the entrapped poet "observes" the recluse, whose movements are guided only by the rhythms of nature. Then, just as suddenly, the recluse disappears, hidden – and replaced – by the images of his immediate milieu: "Slender branches like a lofty pavilion; / Dense foliage, an iridescent canopy." Even within the bounds of this couplet, substitution is evident, albeit in the relatively explicit device of simile. In the language of comparison, where resemblance is the evidence of difference, the stated similarity between the hermit's leafy home and the luxurious dwelling of a successful official is nothing so much as the stark expression of their absolute and irreducible difference, as well as the articulation of a choice. No need here for the bipolar opposition articulated by Tso Ssu in the juxtaposition of *wu* and *yu* – absence and presence. In making a choice based on the perception of the oneness of all things, the recluse (both the current and the aspiring) can have it all. This highlighting of similarity in difference sets in motion the progressive series of substitutions, this time in the form of union, that leads the poet ever closer to achieving the expression of ineffability.

In lines 9 through 10, Lu Chi, like Tso Ssu, invokes the primordial language of music. This music of nature blends seamlessly with music worthy of the most sumptuous court, as the poet invokes the dance tunes of "Chi-ch'u" and "Hui-fang." In contrast to Tso Ssu's explicit question ("Here, what need of string and pipes? / The mountain water has its own crystal tune. / Why wait for voices singing, / When stands of trees sing their own sad song?") – or perhaps in response to it, Lu Chi's substitution is tantalizingly ambiguous. Although modern commentators interpret the allusion to the ancient dance tunes of "Chi-ch'u" and "Hui-fang" as a simple metaphor for the music of the wind in the trees, there is no indication within the poem that the hermit, absent from view, is not filling the forest with the

timeless melodies of his lute. After all, such was the case in Tso Ssu's poem.

The momentary impossibility of distinguishing between the two is resolved in the following couplet, lines 11 and 12: "Clinking crystal is the mountain stream; / Spouting springs rinse singing jade." The reader has gradually been led, through a series of replacements, to a world where man-made music is equated with the superior harmonies of nature – indeed, to the very origins of poetry itself. The mutual exclusiveness of *wu* and *yu* is overridden. The earlier direct simile, too, is superceded, as is any trace of ambiguous blending; man's world is revealed for what it is, and has been summarily erased. In lines 13 and 14, any hint of artifice (and artfulness) disappears, as this nameless, wordless music is shown to be indistinguishable from the rhythm and the geography of nature itself. Like Chuang-tzu's primordial *ch'i*, and like Sun Teng's whistle, the eloquence of nature's music eliminates the need for language, lyrics and even the simplest of man-made musical instruments. This process of reduction, enacted through a series of replacements, effectively carries the poem itself back in time to a point where it posits itself at the origin of the poems that were to succeed it.

At last, in lines 15 and 16, Lu declares, "The attainment of ultimate joy depends not on things without; / To what end degrade one's pure nature?" This sudden shift from the mute eloquence of substitution to the explicit utterance required in posing a rhetorical question might well seem, in retrospect, a betrayal of the aesthetic of the ineffable, an eleventh-hour abandonment of what, a moment ago, seemed to be an unstoppable movement towards ineffability. This reversal is similar to, if subtler than, the change we noted towards the end of Tso Ssu's poem.

More specific to Lu Chi's poem is the way in which his progressive application of the trope of substitution entails a process of reduction: the elimination (or incorporation) of all that is "other" or external, to arrive ultimately at a state of purity. The chain of substitutions comes to an end only in the last line, when the poet himself engages in the process; finally, in an ultimate gesture towards the recuperation of "wholeness," the poet declares his intention to rejoin body and spirit, not by summoning his spirit back to the Confucian demands of a life of service, but by sending his body off to "follow [his] heart's desire," to join his spirit, hidden in the mountains. The poignancy of the moment is heightened by the fact that the climactic moment of his decision hinges not on a reference to Lao-tzu or Chuang-tzu, but to the *Lun-yü*, in which Confucius's disciple Tzu-hsia re-

minds Ssu-ma Niu that wealth and prosperity are determined, not by man, but by heaven.³¹

Still, within the context of our discussion of the rhetoric of ineffability, it is impossible to ignore that the concluding lines of both Tso Ssu's and Lu Chi's poems are a bit at odds with the ideal; for they do betray their ultimate reliance on direct expression and, by reimposing the need to make a choice between service and reclusion, tacitly reinstate the mutual exclusiveness of "having" and "not-having," "being" and "non-being." This last-minute contradiction of the aesthetic of ineffability can be read as the expression of one who desires enlightenment but has not completely attained it. But this reversion to direct description is also a sign of the times: evidence of contemporary *hsüan-hsüeh* 玄學, or "dark learning" philosophical ruminations of the Wei and Chin periods, and characteristic of what has been described as *hsüan-hsüeh* poetry.³² While the transposition of the ineffable into poetic language is still rare in the third century (with the possible exception of the Nineteen Old Poems), the desire to achieve this appears with greater and greater frequency as we approach the T'ang. We notice it, for example, in T'ao Yüan-ming's oft-quoted "In this, there is something of true meaning 此中有真意, / On the verge of uttering it, I've already forgotten the words 欲辯已忘言." ("Twenty Poems on Drinking: No. 5" 飲酒二十首其五); and in T'ao Hung-ching's 陶弘景 (456-536) famous poem:

詔問山中何	<i>Having Been Asked What There Is in the Mountains,</i>
所有賦詩以答	<i>I Compose a Poem in Answer</i>
山中何所有	"What is there, among the mountains?" –
嶺上多白雲	Above the peaks, so many white clouds.
只可自怡悅	I can but rejoice in this, myself;
不堪持寄君	It can't be grasped and sent to you. ³³

³¹ "Tzu-hsia said, 'Life and death are a matter of fate, wealth and prosperity are [decided by] heaven' 死生有命, 富貴在天; Liu Pao-nan 劉寶楠, comp., *Lun-yü cheng-i* 論語正義, sect. 12 "Yen Yüan" 顏淵, ch. 15, p. 264 (Chu-tzu chi-ch'eng edn., vol. 1).

³² *Hsüan-hsüeh* poetry has been identified by modern Chinese scholars as falling into two categories – those that explicitly employ Taoist and Buddhist philosophical terminology, and those that seek to reveal that same spiritual essence in nature itself, merely appending the terminology to what are, essentially, the first Chinese nature poems. Simply put, the consistent and extended use of nature imagery in Tso Ssu's and Lu Chi's poems would seem to place them neatly in the second category. This classification is further elaborated in Ts'ao Tao-heng 曹道衡 and Shen Yü-ch'eng 沈玉成, eds., *Nan-pei-ch'ao wen-hsüeh shih* 南北朝文學史 (Beijing: Chung-kuo she-hui k'o-hsüeh-yuan wen-hsüeh yen-chiu-so, 1991), pp. 30-36.

³³ In Ting Chung-hu 丁仲祐, comp., *Ch'üan Han San-kuo Chin Nan-pei-ch'ao shih* 全漢三國晉南北朝詩 (Taipei: I-wen yin-shu-kuan, 1968), vol. 3, p. 1488.

Even as Tso Ssu's and Lu Chi's use of the trope of replacement both represents the quest for enlightenment and presents itself as a product of that enlightenment, it can only reject language as a tool of communication within the means available at the moment. This combination of generic expectation, philosophical context, and poetic strategies conveys that the Tao, the Taoist recluse, and the poetry itself:

1. exist in a realm beyond language, yet make themselves known through language;
2. exist in a moment in time at the origin of all things, and yet are steeped in tradition; and
3. hold themselves resolutely beyond the sphere of the social while sturdily anchored in its codes.

We are reminded – if anachronistically – of an unforgettable episode in the novel *Journey to the West*. After having journeyed across the continent to India and endured all of the pre-ordained eighty trials, the devout Chinese Buddhist pilgrim Hsüan-tsang and his entourage obtained the Buddhist scriptures they had sought. But they were scriptures on which no words were written.³⁴

CONCLUSION

The figure of the recluse, in its social, philosophical, and literary manifestations, derives its unique significance from its liminality, as a cipher whose function is to mark boundaries – but to mark them in such a way as to blur rather than affirm distinctions. The recluse occupies a privileged place in both the Confucian and Taoist traditions, and, in a certain way, forms one of the junctures where they intersect. The very breach of silence through which the wood-cutter or fisherman inevitably makes himself known betrays the dilemma between service to the state and withdrawal, action and non-action: a dilemma that, while reflecting essential distinctions between those two traditions, also reveals their interdependence. Perhaps the true recluse provided the model, but it was the scholar-official who wrote the poems, the scholar-official who attempted to appropriate in language and action the silent loftiness of the worthy-in-retreat, and who, ultimately, transformed a life in oblivion into a social ideal, imbued with meaning. Conversely, just as the true recluse was dependent upon the scholar-offi-

³⁴ Anthony C. Yu, trans., *Journey to the West* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977) 4, p. 1592.

cial for social legitimacy and influence, so the more pragmatic scholar-official obtained moral legitimacy through his position of "medium," manifest in his unique ability to see what was hidden and transmit the untransmittable. In this way, the figure of the recluse, as a locus of contradictory and mutually dependent moral ideals, closely mirrors the medium of poetry, that territory where language and the ineffable meet and give sustenance one to the other.

The recluse also stands as a signpost in literary history, not distinguishing past from present, or received poetry from poetry-in-the-making, but indicating the region where present voices can retroactively overtake the voices of the past. To the extent that one may attribute a temporal component to the recluse's silence – the withholding of overt traces that could have been transmitted over time – he presents a figure reminiscent of a past age when words and their objects were in perfect concord, and when the sage, like the heavens, did not need to speak; a time preceding that moment when Lao-tzu was compelled to use words to convey the Tao (and long before the moment when he had to explain why it was necessary to do so). This temporal dimension of the recluse – the elegiac pastness of his silence – is reenacted through the diachrony of intertextual devices, as later poets (in a slight twist on Harold Bloom's theme of anxiety) assert their own priority through dialogue with (and, sometimes, the silencing of) their predecessors. Thus, the absent recluse becomes a potent figure through which the poet, simultaneously reaching forward and backward, can strive to free himself from the bonds of accumulated poetic language, and, in this striving, come close to realizing a poetics of the ineffable. In the absent-recluse poems, declarations of enlightenment harbor within them the desire to remain unspoken, and music replaces words so that it can one day be replaced by silence and take the position of the poetry that preceded all poetry.

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CTS	<i>Ch'uan T'ang shih</i> 全唐詩
WH	<i>Wen-hsüan</i> 文選